

Concluding comments of the Committee on the Elimination of
Discrimination against Women: Spain

Second periodic report

303. The Committee considered the second periodic report of Spain (CEDAW/C/13/Add.19 and Amend.1) at its 201st meeting, on 28 January 1992.

304. The Committee thought that the first report had been very good, and noted the strong commitment of Spain to reform, modernization and the equality of women. However, the second periodic report consisted mainly of the 1988-1990 Plan for Equal Opportunities. It did not always show what changes had occurred. Some of the figures were out of date, and did not permit up-to-date comparisons. It seemed to have been written in 1988, though dated 1990. The material was organized in accordance with the following headings: legal system; family and social protection; education and culture; employment and labour relations; and internal cooperation and political organization.

305. The amendment repeated much of the material in the second periodic report, but did not state that it was a replacement.

306. Despite those observations, the report and supplement had a great deal of valuable information, and showed the continuing commitment of Spain to principles of equality.

307. The representative of Spain addressed the Committee and emphasized the importance given by her Government to United Nations conventions on human rights, and to the obligations and objectives associated with the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women. The Government wished that the United Nations would increase its activities related to the role of women. The objectives set forth by the Convention were fully consistent with the Spanish Constitution, which had proclaimed the principle of equality of men and women before the law, and called for measures to make equality fully effective. Continuous government effort was needed to accomplish those objectives.

308. The representative said that a main change since the first periodic report had been Spain's acceptance of European norms on equality and of European programmes of affirmative action for 1980-1985 and 1985-1990, as a consequence of entry into the European Community. Another key event had been the first plan of action for equality of opportunities of women, adopted by the Council of Ministers in September 1988. The Steering Council of the Institute for Women's Affairs (IWA) had drafted the plan and had been entrusted with the initiation and follow-up of the measures contained in it. The plan was comprehensive and horizontal. It had established objectives, measures to meet those objectives and institutions responsible for those measures. The objectives were to be achieved between 1987 and 1990. One of the main objectives of the plan was to complete the normative development of the constitutional principle of equality. The plan was also to give

legitimacy to positive action in favour of women and to enhance the acceptance and implementation of such measures. It was also aimed at developing the social infrastructure for the most disadvantaged women.

309. The representative gave the example of education to illustrate the achievements of the plan. Differences between men and women in education were now of a qualitative rather than a quantitative nature. Female students indeed had a tendency to opt for certain fields of study that often had fewer job opportunities, although their representation in the technical field was increasing. Since 1987, female attendance in universities had been slightly higher than that of men. Regular vocational training remained an area where female participation was less than that of male.

310. The representative then provided the Committee with information and statistics on the plan's achievements in the field of employment and stressed that there had been a continuous increase in female activity rates between 1984 and 1991 as the actual rate was 33.3 per cent. That had been done, however, mainly through increased female participation in the service sector. The female labour force remained concentrated in professions related to education, health, textiles and personal services. Female representation in public administration had increased in recent years both in the central administration and in higher or senior-level posts. The lack of an entrepreneurial culture aware of women's capabilities was the leading cause in women's low representation in higher level employment in general, and the representative said that public administration had to take the lead in promoting new recruiting habits. Turning to the issue of women in politics, the representative noted that more women had been elected in both general and local elections. The quota system initiated by the Socialist Party helped because it was followed by other political parties that might not have established concrete quotas but might increase the participation of women in various positions. She concluded that there had been important achievements in Spain, but that a lot remained to be done. Achieving de facto equality implied more progress in the field of education, public participation and the sharing of domestic tasks.

311. The representative then replied to questions contained in the list that had been transmitted to the Government and referred to general observations made by members of the Committee.

312. She mentioned that the structure of the report was in conformity with the plan of action for equality of opportunities of women. The statistics provided were the most recent available and, where possible, were dated from the first quarter of 1991.

313. The Committee noted that IWA was the agency responsible for implementing equal opportunity for women. The plan of action for equal opportunities of women showed a strong commitment to equality, in line with past achievements. It was asked if there was an evaluation of the plan and if information on any evaluation could be provided.

314. Answering questions asked by the Committee on areas of change, the representative reported that the plan of action for equality of opportunities of women had been evaluated in December 1990. Women's associations and experts had been participating in that process together with the ministerial

departments involved in the implementation of the plan. Out of the 120 measures contained in the plan, 116 measures had been fulfilled in December 1990. All legislative changes had been implemented with the exception of those dealing with men's pre-eminence in determining the order of names for children. Important improvements had been made through the programme of positive actions, but efforts had to be sustained in the medium term.

315. The Committee noted that the Convention was domestic law and could be invoked in the courts; it overrode inconsistent laws. Laws contravening the Convention were invalid and of no effect. It asked whether women could go to the Constitutional Court and to the Court at Luxembourg, and whether there were any cases that had been decided. It was noted that affirmative action had been established as lawful when it was due to an objection and reasonable cause that justified it. The Committee asked for the text of that provision and information on laws providing for positive action.

316. On the effect of the Convention in domestic law, the representative read article 10 of the Spanish Constitution, which stated that Spanish norms on fundamental rights and liberties should be interpreted in conformity with the provisions of all international human rights treaties signed by Spain. Hence, the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women could be invoked before ordinary courts as well as before the supreme court. Individuals could resort directly to the constitutional court with regard to violations of fundamental rights and liberties, including the principle of equality affirmed by the Constitution in article 14. There was a wide jurisprudence of the constitutional court on the interpretation of article 14 in conformity with international treaties. By a judgement of 1987, the constitutional court had established that positive action was not a form of discrimination as forbidden by article 14. The court had recalled that public authorities in Spain had the responsibility for promoting the conditions necessary to ensure that all individuals enjoyed freedom and equality, in conformity with article 9.2 of the Constitution. That legitimated the implementation of positive action.

317. The Committee noted that law 11/1990 was aimed at discrimination on the ground of sex. It dealt with residence, common law, inheritance, criminal law, maternal preference, etc. It was asked whether all legal discrimination had been removed, including discrimination relating to nationality.

318. The Committee noted that Spain still had a reservation under which ratification did not affect the constitutional provisions concerning succession to the Crown. Preference to men in regard to titles of nobility had been abolished. When the initial report was presented, the possibility of change in regard to succession to the Crown had been mentioned. It was asked if there had been further developments.

319. The representative replied that the Spanish reservation to the Convention did not affect the goal and purpose of the Convention, and that a constitutional reform would be necessary to withdraw it.

Articles 1 to 4

320. On questions asked under articles 1 to 4, the representative informed the Committee that Spanish women's associations were part of the Steering Committee of IWA and had participated in the evaluation of the first plan, based on which the second periodic report and the amendment had been prepared. She confirmed that Spain had taken into account the general recommendations of the Committee in preparing its report.

321. The Committee noted that it was commented in the initial report that domestic work was still done by women with little help, and men were not interested in equality issues. It said that the Institute would be undertaking a campaign to encourage men to share domestic responsibility, to encourage parents to ensure all kinds of professions were open to girls and to encourage young people to choose professions with an eye to the future. The Committee asked what the effects of that campaign had been.

Article 5

322. On article 5 and questions on traditional roles and stereotyping, the representative reported campaigns carried out by IWA to promote a better sharing of domestic responsibilities and a diversification of professional opportunities for young women. Men's attitudes towards women remained very traditional, and the impact of actions against stereotyping would be visible in the medium term only. The representative also referred to the general law of 1988 on advertising. The law had declared unlawful advertising that offended the dignity of a person and was injurious to the values and rights recognized in the Constitution, and it gave judges the right to suspend such advertising until further analysis was made. There was no jurisprudence so far.

323. The Committee asked for the full text of the provision, which could be a valuable model.

324. The Committee mentioned that IWA had put forward criteria to be used in all official advertising and asked if those criteria had been met.

325. The representative said that IWA had made a manual on using non-sexist language in administrative documents.

326. She referred also to a campaign aimed at encouraging men to behave according to the principles of equality, and she stated that although men ideologically favour those principles their behaviour was contradictory.

Violence against women (articles 2, 5, 11, 12 and 16)

327. In answer to questions on violence, the representative read the definition of rape contained in the penal code. Since 1989, the code established rape to be carnal access to another person by vaginal, anal or oral means, by the use of force or intimidation or by taking advantage of the victim's insanity, or if the victim was under the age of 12. It was punishable by a prison term of from 12 to 20 years. There had been a change, and currently the Supreme Court only required evidence of non-consent by the victim. Some lower courts, however, continued to require evidence of resistance.

328. With regard to sexual harassment, she said that that action was not defined as a crime by the penal code, but as a serious violation of the labour order, punished by a fine. The labour inspection was in charge of implementing that sanction. The representative gave examples of programmes for women victims of sexual assault. Those included the training of State security forces and the creation of services to give special assistance by women police to women at police stations.

329. On violence in the family, the representative said that rape and other sexual offences were independent crimes in which the active party could be a family member or an unrelated person. In relation to offences involving ill-treatment of one member of a family by another, rape and sexual assault in general were treated more severely. She informed the Committee that, according to the Organic Law of 1989, the sterilization of persons suffering from grave mental deficiencies was legal if approved by a judge and by the legal counsel of the incompetent person.

Article 6

330. The representative said that prostitution of others was punishable under the penal code. Prosecuting prostitution associated with illegal immigration at the Portuguese border had proved difficult. But the Spanish police had programmes to punish the exploitation of prostitution of both Spanish women and illegal immigrants. Programmes developed by the central, regional or local governments for prostitutes included health-care services, child-care, training for vocational opportunities, fellowships and scholarships.

Articles 7 and 8

331. It was commented in the second periodic report that there was no significant change in political participation: 6.5 and 5.5 per cent in the Senate. But it was noted in the Amendment that from 1989 the percentage of women in Parliament was 14.6 per cent, owing to the increase in the Socialist Workers Party and the United Left. Of Senators, 10 per cent were women. The Socialist Party had approved a quota of 25 per cent of women in posts of responsibility. It was asked if other parties had followed that example. The Committee asked what goals and quotas had been set for women. It was asked how the quota system operated and if it were for candidates or elected representatives. How did it affect the voting patterns? The Committee noted that the report mentioned a programme for women in higher public office. In the amended report it was noted that there were 12.2 per cent women directors-general in 1991. It was asked if those programmes had been effective.

332. The representative said that the Communist Party had introduced a quota of 35 per cent for the participation of women in its governing body and on its electoral lists. Other parties had actually started to include larger numbers of women on their lists. The quota system in the context of closed electoral lists had led to an increase in the number of women in regional assemblies and in the national parliament. Participation of women at higher levels of public administration had also risen between 1987 and 1991. The programme of affirmative action had played a key role, together with the increased participation of women in civil service training institutes.

333. The Committee noted that under Decree Law 1/1988, women might enter all forms of military employment under the same conditions of equality as men. The Committee inquired if women had reached the highest levels of the service and if there were any distinctions that excluded them.

334. The representative replied that there was no distinct exclusion of women from the higher levels of the service, but that there had been no time for women who had joined the army to develop fully their careers.

335. On a question on women in the diplomatic corps, she said that their share had increased by more than 100 per cent, and that 50 per cent of the successful candidates in the last entrance competition in 1991 had been women.

Article 10

336. The Committee noted that the initial report stated that only a minority of women had chosen technical studies. Plans mentioned to the Committee had included mixed schools to be obligatory; reform of teaching material; and programmes to increase the participation of girls in technology. In the second periodic report, the figures for education were only up to 1985. In the amendment, the latest information was that women were equal in enrolments at secondary schools and higher in tertiary institutions. But while there were more females than males in universities, there were fewer in vocational training, and still fewer in technical high schools. Women chose science less often than boys. The Committee asked what vocational guidance was available to people completing secondary education; what measures there were to encourage more women to take vocational training or to study technology at university; whether they had been effective in combating gender-based job segregation; whether there were positive measures, such as special scholarships, to encourage women to take up careers in non-traditional areas; and what was being done to monitor the plan for non-sexist use of language, and teaching material.

337. In answer to several questions, the representative reported various programmes to train professors and school guidance counselors on non-discriminatory vocational guidance. She also reported programmes to enhance female participation in new technologies, including a European Community project and counselling campaigns for educators and teachers of new technology. Such programmes contributed to the promotion of women's participation in sectors of employment traditionally considered male. Other measures in the area included campaigns for the diversification of professional options through the distribution of posters, for example, or through seminars on non-sexist orientation. The representative addressed the issue of the monitoring of the plan for non-sexist use of language and reported a whole range of activities. For example, material and videos of IWA on sex equality were being broadly circulated, a prize had been established in 1988 to promote the production of non-discriminatory didactic material and the Ministry of Education had established a national competition for the preparation of curriculum material giving special attention to the equality of opportunity between men and women.

Article 11

338. It was stated by the Committee that 31.9 per cent of women were in the active population in 1987 (compared with 27.8 per cent in 1985), representing 33.5 per cent of the total active population. In 1991, women were 35.3 per cent of the total active population. The Committee asked what the obstacles were to higher participation in the work force by women and if there were de facto obstructions to training, etc.

339. The unemployment rate of women was 27.7 per cent and for men it was 16.5 per cent. In 1991, women had an unemployment rate of 23.2 per cent against 11.9 per cent for men. The Committee asked what the education and skills were of unemployed women and if a lack of training was the reason for high unemployment.

340. In answer, the representative differentiated between three main obstacles to women's participation in the economy: entrepreneurial culture, underevaluation of their capacity by the women themselves and unshared family responsibilities. She said that there were no de facto obstacles to access to professional training. The unemployment rate for women had decreased but remained twice as high as that of men. Lack of training was not the only explanation for the higher unemployment rate for women, though poorly educated women, especially those who had left the labour market for several years for family reasons, indeed experienced higher unemployment rates. There were also corporate obstacles to women's activity.

341. The Committee noted that law 3/1989 extended maternity leave to 16 weeks; it could be shared. A parent could take three years to look after a child and retain his/her place and have the period count for seniority. It had been made an offence to discriminate in respect of wages, hours, etc., on the ground of sex; breach of rules regarding pregnancy and nursing were also offences. Decree 521/1990 reversed the burden of proof in discrimination cases, so that the defendant had to show objective and reasonable justification for the actions taken.

342. The Committee asked (a) for more information on how those laws operated and asked if there had been proceedings or prosecutions and if they were leading to changes in practice; (b) if the evaluation of the labour market and programmes for women had taken place; (c) if part-time jobs were mainly held by women, and if they were regulated by national labour agreements; (d) if part-time workers had the same terms and conditions as full-time workers; and (e) if there were special programmes to encourage the employment of disabled women.

343. Turning to questions on parental leave, the representative said that the law providing for an extended 16 weeks of leave allowed the last four weeks to be used by either the father or the mother. That choice was also given for the leave for child care. The dismissal of a woman because she was pregnant was considered null by law and the employer was forced to readmit the worker or to pay her salary. A 1990 law had recognized the reversal of the burden of proof. But it had been actually applied when a female worker alleged discrimination on the basis of sex, since a 1981 sentence of the constitutional court. The representative said that there were very few part-time workers in Spain, but that they were entitled to the same social

security schemes as full-time workers. She also reported programmes for the educational and professional training of men and women with disabilities and informed the Committee that quotas had been reserved for persons with disabilities in enterprises with more than 25 employees.

Article 12

344. The Committee requested figures for fertility and birth rates. It said that despite the fact of contraception a high proportion did not use efficient methods. It seemed more education on contraception was needed and asked if there were programmes for that. It also wanted to know the results of the study of adolescent pregnancies.

345. The representative answered that the Organic Law on the General Organization of the Educational System provided for the incorporation of health education in the educational system and that the fertility rate had declined from 1.64 per cent in 1985 to 1.36 per cent in 1989. Studies showed that the use of contraceptive methods was higher among women who had declared that they had a partner than among the female population of fertile age as a whole. The representative gave examples of programmes to increase awareness of contraception such as pilot programmes for sex education of young people. On teenage pregnancy, she said that the last survey was dated from 1985 and had counted 29,586 births among women under 20 years of age. Consequences included school drop-out and medical problems linked to attempts to conceal the pregnancy as long as possible. Answering questions on the law on assisted techniques of reproduction, the representative said that every woman could make use of those techniques as long as she gave her consent on their free and aware utilization, was more than 18 years old and fully competent. There was an express prohibition against surrogate motherhood.

346. She said that the latest data on the acquired immune deficiency syndrome (AIDS) revealed that 6,840 men and 1,359 women were affected, and women represented 17 per cent of all victims. The national programme for AIDS care and prevention included specific activities for women, and IWA had published an informative bulletin on women and AIDS.

347. The representative then answered a question on breast and gynaecological cancer. There was no national programme for the prevention of those cancers. There were, however, pilot studies to evaluate the efficiency of the different tests. Primary prevention included research on possible risk factors for breast cancer such as nutritional habits, while secondary prevention included mammography and periodic testing and participation in a European programme on cancer. There had been various programmes developed by the autonomous communities and private health centres to prevent such cancer, and all autonomous communities were to elaborate plans to reduce mortality from such cancer among the female population under the age of 65 by 5 per cent by the year 2000.

348. The representative finally provided the Committee with information on drug consumption and said it had emerged as a problem in the 1970s and 1980s, and had become rather high. The number of drug users who resorted to the health system had increased between 1987 and 1990. The autonomous communities had their own plan for the prevention and cure of drug abuse. She presented the 1985 national drug prevention plan, the relative institutions that had been established, and the indicators used, as well as some of its realizations.

Article 13

349. The Committee noted that action had been taken since the initial report to remedy deficiencies in the provision of social services. A guarantee fund had been established for food and accommodation and for social security for people employed in the home; unequal treatment in pension scales for disabled and injured women had been removed. The tariff for compensation for disability was the same for women as for men since May 1988. The old age pension for those unemployed at home was equal to the general pension. It asked if the new social security measures and guarantee fund referred to the unwaged sector of the economy and if women working in family enterprises or at home got social security. Also, who paid contributions and at what age were benefits paid? What social security was available for homemakers on retirement or disability? Did they qualify independently, or as dependants?

350. The representative said that public health services were universal in Spain. The key factor for determining if a person employed at home or as a family worker would receive a pension was whether or not she had contributed to the pension scheme during a sufficient number of years. If not, she would receive financial assistance other than a pension, provided she met a number of additional conditions associated with retirement or invalidity payments. Non-contributory pensions were recognized as a right of the beneficiary that could be claimed as such and were not subject to the existence of resources or granted as a gracious concession, and they formed part of the social security system as a whole.

Article 14

351. In the initial report it was noted that Spain was mainly industrial, and the services for rural women were not so good. For example, young rural women were disadvantaged in such areas as family planning, child care for seasonal workers and access to technology. It was asked what special programmes were being planned to improve the position of rural women.

352. The representative informed the Committee that funds had been allocated in the budget for 1992 for training courses for women in rural areas. Training for work in cooperatives or in rural tourism would be provided, especially to women with children.

Article 16

353. In answer to queries, the representative said that courts had been instituted in major Spanish towns to deal with marriage, divorce and separation and other issues. Specialized personnel including social workers and psychologists provided assistance.

354. In their additional comments, members praised the Government of Spain and its representative for the comprehensive, frank and well-organized reports and answers. There was a strong governmental commitment to improve the situation of women in Spain, and significant progress had been achieved in a short time. The plan of action for equality of opportunities of women was found very ambitious and successful. The law against sexist advertising and actions against stereotyping in employment and education was considered especially successful. Members noted that the de facto changes were slow, despite big

advances made in the legal field. Areas of slow progress included the sharing of domestic tasks and child care with men, participation in studies on science, as well as economic participation. The new threats were AIDS and drugs. Members were confident, however, that progress would continue and felt that Spain could serve as a model for other countries with regard to the promotion of equality.

355. Members requested more information on the decentralization of the policy for equality to the various regions in Spain. They asked if the successful adoption of legal changes had led to a decline in the feminist movement. Members asked what the goals were for the next period of reporting and whether changes in attitudes, especially with regard to the sharing of domestic responsibilities between men and women, had been identified as an area for further progress. Had there been action to encourage men to participate more fully in those tasks? The representative was asked if a prosecutor who took note of a crime of rape could set up a procedure in court without the crime being notified by the victim. Members asked whether there was a law establishing a quota system for political elections, whether there was always the political will among those in charge of the parties to put more women on the lists and, if not, what was done about it. They noted that there were no women in the constitutional court and sought information on the number of women in the rest of the judiciary system. They asked if the increase in the share of women in the diplomatic corps reflected difficulties in finding employment on the labour market in general. Members took note of research on obstacles to equal access to education and asked what had been done to adapt research to the modern society. They expressed the wish that all graphic material on non-sexist education could be made available to the Committee. Members sought more information on incentives granted to enterprises hiring women in traditionally male fields. They asked whether the law allowed doctors to refuse to perform abortions on the ground of religious or moral reasons, whether the method was practised. They also sought information on the age of women who had an abortion, and on the health structure in which abortion was performed.

356. In answering additional questions asked by members, the representative said that regional governments and sometimes local administrations had comprehensive plans for equality of opportunity. Those included measures within their field of competence. In regions governed by the Socialist Party, there were plans on equality of opportunity. She confirmed that there had been a decline in the feminist movement as a result of the achievement of de jure equality but said that women had increasingly participated in the associative women's movement.

357. The representative agreed that much work remained to be done to change attitudes in Spain and to reduce the double burden of women. Spain's four main goals for the future were to ensure compliance with laws on equality and to apply fully and effectively their goals; to continue pursuing policies for education and promotion of employment that would also place women in decision-making positions; to change attitudes and improve the public image of women; and to promote the sharing of domestic responsibilities. She hoped the Government would adopt the second plan for the development of women encompassing those measures in 1992.

358. On rape, the representative said that a modification of the law had made it a public offence, which meant that an offender could no longer be pardoned in the course of the procedure if the victim forgave him.

359. Turning to additional questions on public life and leadership, she said that there was no law establishing a quota system. The Socialist Party had set a precedent and convinced other parties to establish quotas or include more women. On the existence of political will to promote women inside political parties, she said that electoral lists were indeed established by the leaders of political parties and that quotas had been established to overcome their tendency to exclude women. She recognized that the objectives on political participation had not been reached, although there had been a favourable trend as regards women's representation in Parliament, which could and had to be accelerated. There were no women in the Supreme Court, she confirmed, but they were numerous in the judiciary. Thirty-eight per cent of the judges and 31 per cent of the prosecutors were women, and it was hoped that they would pursue their careers and occupy high-level positions in the future. Turning to the increased number of women in the diplomatic corps, she said it was not an effect of recession, since Spain had satisfactory economic growth rates. Like other fields of public administration it was rather due to a system of recruitment based on merit, which was not always the case in the private sector.

360. On education, the representative said that female representation was lower in technical and engineering schools, but that half the students studying mathematics and science were women. She said that research on education in general would be pursued.

361. The representative said that there had been 500,000 peseta subsidies to employers hiring women in non-traditional fields, and another 500,000 pesetas in tax release. The provision concerned all professions where women were underrepresented, which constituted a long list. The measure had not had the positive effect expected because it was still not sufficiently well known. Similar measures had worked for encouraging the employment of young people.

362. Turning to questions on abortion, the representative said that the revision of article 417 of the Spanish Penal Code had legalized abortion under certain specific conditions: when there was a risk to the life or health of the mother, when the pregnancy was the consequence of rape or when there was a presumption that the foetus would be born with serious physical or mental defects. While most abortions were performed in private clinics, 98 per cent of those with high risk were performed in public clinics. The representative stated that the Committee's concern for drug traffic was fully shared by the Government and that Spain was a port of entry for drugs. She recalled that numerous measures had been taken by public authorities in that field.

363. The representative made available to the Committee the full text of the general law on advertising and the educational material it had requested.

364. In concluding observations, the Committee expressed its appreciation of the comprehensive report and answers, which showed the Government's commitment to achieving equality and improvements in the situation of women. It noted that there were areas of progress and areas of slower changes, and said that the Government's determination was very positive. Members appealed to the

Spanish Government to direct part of its assistance to developing countries to programmes for women, and for areas of implementation of the Convention in particular. The representative took note of the appeal and said that she hoped that the Government would be able to give a satisfactory answer, and that that had been done to a certain extent in assistance to Spanish-speaking countries.